

Qualitative Article Analysis Worksheet

Directions: You should be able to complete most questions for most research studies, although sometimes this may require that you make inferences, read between the lines, or attending to what information isn't stated but should have been provided. Don't alter the formatting of the questions, simply enter your response below each. You can add as much new space below each question as needed to respond.

Hébert, T. P. (2001). Jermaine: A critical case study of a gifted Black child living in rural poverty. *Gifted Child Quarterly*, 45(2), 85-103.

Your name: Christian Price – June 2022

1. What is/are the research question(s)? (30pts)

What are the educational needs of gifted Black children living in rural poverty? How does an impoverished environment negatively affect children? As kudzu chokes life out of vegetation, does the isolation of an impoverished, rural environment have a similar effect on the creativity of a gifted child?

2. Summarize the main points of the introduction and/or literature review in a paragraph or by using bullet points. How did researcher(s) identify the research gap/need of the study? (30pts)

- I'm assuming that the section after the abstract is the introduction, but it's not specifically labeled.
- The researcher references the rural south
- She stated that she came to understand how the impoverished environment negatively affected children.
- As a part of a three-year study, she pondered the question, "As kudzu chokes life out of vegetation, does the isolation of an impoverished, rural environment have a similar effect on the creativity of a gifted child?"
- The data she collected allowed her to explore the role environment plays in developing the gifts and talents of children.

3. What is the sample size? What method of sampling was used (please justify your decision)? (30pts)

I think the researcher used the purpose sampling method. I don't see where she writes about the sample in the study. This is inferred after looking at the data.

4. State the key phenomenon. What particular theories and/or theoretical notions informed your understanding of the phenomena investigated in the study? (50pts)

The researcher states that her primary motivation of the study is to examine the life of a gifted Black child living in rural poverty and to understand how his rural environment influence his academic achievement. Critical theory is what she states in the study. I think the is an example of descriptive education research and/or experimental research. She specifically states, "In this critical case study, Jermaine, a gifted Black child living in poverty, is the phenomenon under investigation, and the primary goal of the article is to focus on his experiences in his rural environment."

5. What research design/approach did researchers use (Check Textbook - p.388) (please justify your decision)? (30pts)

Ethnography because that is what she states but also, she interacts with and observes specific societal and ethnic groups in their real-life environment. She Observes/interacts with the school district, family, and mentors of the subject.

6. How did researchers discuss the validity of the study? (40pts)

The researcher conducted intensive direct observations and interviews until data saturation occurred when new information collected was redundant and did not off any additional insights to elucidate further understanding. She also states that detailed descriptions of how the investigations were conducted as well as the measures took to ensure accuracy of observation were recorded to provide evidence on which the findings were grounded. In addition, she makes notes that it was arranged for her fellow university researchers to play "devil's advocate" in reviewing the data analysis and the interpretations of the finds.

7. What data collection method(s) was/were used? (30pts)

The researcher stated that the process incorporated the following four phases: review of the portfolio and entry into the community, three weeks of participant observations, one-year correspondence with the child and his teacher, and a final visit and an in-depth interview with the child. She then describes each phase in detail.

8. What data analysis method(s) was/were used? (30pts)

She states the data analysis consists of making a detailed description of the case and its context. Additionally, she states, "I began "categorical aggregation" (p. 74) by searching for a collection of instances from the data, looking for issue-relevant meanings to emerge. I then examined single instances in my data and drew meaning from them without looking for multiple instances. Stake referred to this "direct interpretation" (p. 74) as a process of pulling the data apart and then putting them back together in more meaningful ways. I then worked to "establish patterns" (p. 78) and looked for any correspondence between two or more patterns or categories. Following this, I attempted to present my findings descriptively to facilitate my

readers' forming "naturalistic generalizations" (p.85), which are conclusions readers develop through vicarious experiences so well constructed that they feel as if the experience was their own. Therefore, in my data analysis process, the themes that emerged began with the analysis of my initial observations, were constantly refined throughout the data collection and analysis process, and continuously shaped the formation of categories (LeCompte & Preissle, 1993). To conclude my analyses, I developed generalizations about Jermaine's story in terms of patterns and how they compare and contrast with published literature on gifted students in rural communities."

9. How did researchers discuss positionality? (30pts)

Positionality refers to the how differences in social position and power shape identities and access in society. To this she speaks about the subjects emerging of self-identity. She goes on to talk about the understanding of self-concept. Then she talks about something that's described as resilience. This is where Jermaine overcomes chronic adversity through resilience. To her this is how he developed a stable healthy personality.

10. What is the answer to the research question(s)? (20pts)

The researcher summarized that educators should use Jermaine's story as a reminder that across the country children who show potential for exceptional performance are present in every segment of society. Gifted Black children greatly depend on educational policy makers and the efforts of educators/mentors working to assure a better tomorrow for Jermaine and others like him.

11. What suggestions for further study did researchers make? (30pts)

This critical case study highlights a need to continue examining the life experiences of gifted Black children living in rural, impoverished communities in various parts of this country. The study needs to be replicated with gifted African American youngsters in different geographical regions. In addition, critical case studies should also examine the experiences of gifted young females in rural settings. Researchers interested in discovering whether a connection exists between resilience and creativity may want to consider pursuing additional research in order to assist children living in impoverished conditions.

12. Provide an overall assessment of article quality using the following Likert scale (10pt):

- A. very weak and of little value
- B. weak, but makes a limited contribution to the field
- C. between B & D
- D. strong with minor flaws that limit the conclusions
- E. very strong with believable conclusions

13. Support your overall assessment you provided in #12 by summarizing what you see are the major strengths and weaknesses of this article. For weaknesses, provide suggestions for improving the specific aspect in the research study. Focus on your personal assessment. (90pts)

On the Likert scale I think it's most likely selection C. The reason for that is because it makes a strong case but lacks in some areas. The subject matter and research question is a valid and troublesome societal issue. I think the researcher does a good job of collecting data and analyzing that data but could do a better job of delineating the research questions. I also think that she makes a good argument the better educational policy needs to be written to help underserved students such as Jermaine. Her point that students in predominantly Black rural schools are underserved is well made. I think she lacks in the introduction and conclusion/summary. She spends all this time describing the data, but the summary is one of the smallest paragraphs in the entire article. She also strives to make too many connections instead of focusing solely on the phenomena and research question. She doesn't do a completely adequate job of answering the research question. While reading this I came up with so many more questions than answers. I think she could have strengthened it the summary by talking about desired educational outcomes for a student such as Jermaine to compare best case scenario vs his current situation. I just think there needs to overall be a tighter focus on material in the article.